EXHIBIT 41

1	X06-UWY-CV18-6046436-S	: SUPERIOR COURT
2	ERICA LAFFERTY	: COMPLEX LITIGATION DOCKET
3	V	: AT WATERBURY, CONNECTICUT
4	ALEX EMRIC JONES	
5	X06-UWY-CV18-6046437-S	: SUPERIOR COURT
6	WILLIAM SHERLACH	: COMPLEX LITIGATION DOCKET
7	V	: AT WATERBURY, CONNECTICUT
8	ALEX EMRIC JONES	
9	X06-UWY-CV18-6046438-S	: SUPERIOR COURT
10	WILLIAM SHERLACH	: COMPLEX LITIGATION DOCKET
11	V	: AT WATERBURY, CONNECTICUT
12	ALEX EMRIC JONES	: OCTOBER 4, 2022
13	BEFORE THE HONORABLE BARBARA BELLIS, JUDGE AND JURY	
14	VOLUME I MORNING SESS	SION
14 15		SION
	VOLUME I MORNING SESS	SION
15	APPEARANCES: Representing the Pla	aintiffs:
15 16	A P P E A R A N C E S: Representing the Pla ATTORNEY CHRISTOR ATTORNEY ALINOR S	aintiffs: PHER MATTEI STERLING
15 16 17	A P P E A R A N C E S: Representing the Pla ATTORNEY CHRISTOR	aintiffs: PHER MATTEI STERLING
15 16 17 18	A P P E A R A N C E S: Representing the Pla ATTORNEY CHRISTOR ATTORNEY ALINOR S ATTORNEY JOSHUA	aintiffs: PHER MATTEI STERLING KOSKOFF
15 16 17 18 19	A P P E A R A N C E S: Representing the Pla ATTORNEY CHRISTOR ATTORNEY ALINOR S	aintiffs: PHER MATTEI STERLING KOSKOFF
15 16 17 18 19 20	A P P E A R A N C E S: Representing the Pla ATTORNEY CHRISTOR ATTORNEY ALINOR S ATTORNEY JOSHUA R Representing the Des	aintiffs: PHER MATTEI STERLING KOSKOFF fendant: PATTIS RECORDED BY:
15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A P P E A R A N C E S: Representing the Pla ATTORNEY CHRISTOR ATTORNEY ALINOR S ATTORNEY JOSHUA R Representing the Des	aintiffs: PHER MATTEI STERLING KOSKOFF fendant: PATTIS RECORDED BY: LINDA COON TRANSCRIBED BY:
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A P P E A R A N C E S: Representing the Pla ATTORNEY CHRISTOR ATTORNEY ALINOR S ATTORNEY JOSHUA R Representing the Des	aintiffs: PHER MATTEI STERLING KOSKOFF fendant: PATTIS RECORDED BY: LINDA COON TRANSCRIBED BY: LINDA COON, RPR Court Monitor/Court Reporter
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A P P E A R A N C E S: Representing the Pla ATTORNEY CHRISTOR ATTORNEY ALINOR S ATTORNEY JOSHUA R Representing the Des	aintiffs: PHER MATTEI STERLING KOSKOFF fendant: PATTIS RECORDED BY: LINDA COON TRANSCRIBED BY: LINDA COON, RPR
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	A P P E A R A N C E S: Representing the Pla ATTORNEY CHRISTOR ATTORNEY ALINOR S ATTORNEY JOSHUA R Representing the Des	aintiffs: PHER MATTEI STERLING KOSKOFF fendant: PATTIS RECORDED BY: LINDA COON TRANSCRIBED BY: LINDA COON, RPR Court Monitor/Court Reporter 400 Grand Street

1 THE COURT: Good morning, Marshal, good morning 2 everyone. 3 Please be seated. 4 ATTY. MATTEI: Good morning, Your Honor. THE COURT: All right. We are here on Lafferty 5 6 v. Jones. This is week four, day thirteen if we 7 count yesterday's Charge Conference. 8 If counsel could please identify themselves for 9 the record? 10 ATTY. MATTEI: Good morning, Your Honor. Chris Mattei on behalf of the plaintiffs, joined by Alinor 11 12 Sterling, and Josh Koskoff. 13 ATTY. KOSKOFF: Good morning, Your Honor. 14 ATTY. STERLING: Good morning, Your Honor. 15 ATTY. PATTIS: Norm Pattis, Judge, on behalf of 16 the defendants, Free Speech Systems and Alex Jones. 17 THE COURT: Good morning. 18 And let me just say to the audience, that in 19 accordance with judicial branch policy, only those 20 entities that have been specifically authorized to 21 photograph or film may do so. If anyone violates 22 their policy, their devices will be confiscated and 23 they will be removed from the courtroom. 24 All right. Do we have any -- once again, your jury is here on time. They are a very conscientious 25 26 group.

Do we have any housekeeping matters before we

get started?

ATTY. MATTEI: No housekeeping matters that we need to deal with now --

THE COURT: Oh, good.

ATTY. MATTEI: -- but just to give Your Honor a heads up of something we should deal with at some point today, when it make sense, and that is, I understand that Mr. Jones is considering whether to testify, most likely, tomorrow. I've had discussions with counsel about that. It's our view that there should be an offer of proof in light of the various -- as to what he intends to testify about in light of the various rulings, the default, and some of his conduct outside the courtroom during the course of this proceeding.

I don't want to speak for Attorney Pattis, but I believe that he agrees that that would be an efficient way to understand precisely the scope of testimony, if any, that Mr. Jones will be permitted to offer. So, I think we can deal with that -- we should deal with that today so that Mr. Jones can consider that, and so that the Court can kind of prepare for that testimony, if any.

ATTY. PATTIS: Generally, I resist offers of proof as the Court is interfering with the presentation of a party's case. And I think that we did have that discussion. There would be some use in

it, although, you know -- and I had an argument as to why it might not be necessary. So, I think we should argue whether it's necessary. If the Court orders me to give one, I'll give one. And that might be --

Certainly, the law of the case is complex.

Mr. Jones was advised of it prior to his

cross-examination. I certainly wouldn't oppose

another advisement of that. I don't think there have

been any rulings since his last testimony to add to

that, but I think it would be helpful to address his

testimony later in the day, Judge.

THE COURT: All right. You just let me know when it's a good time. Okay?

ATTY. PATTIS: And may we approach briefly just on a quick housekeeping matter?

THE COURT: Absolutely.

(SIDEBAR).

ATTY. PATTIS: You'll probably hear about this from sources other than me, but I wanted you to hear about it from me. I know, apparently he (INAUDIBLE) media here this morning (INAUDIBLE) press conference. It's my understanding that he's giving another one this afternoon. I just don't want you to think that I'm (INAUDIBLE) on anything that is expected. (INAUDIBLE) participate in (INAUDIBLE). I'm informing him of the Court's orders. I've requested, as you suggested, that I do -- not to address jury --

1 the jury at all in his comments. Beyond that, Judge, 2 I don't know what to do but I wanted you to be aware 3 of (INAUDIBLE). THE COURT: Let me know what time it was this 4 morning. I just wonder if any of the (INAUDIBLE) 5 There's Ron. Do they come in that side door 6 7 too? 8 THE CLERK: Pardon me? 9 THE COURT: They come in that side door? 10 THE CLERK: Yes. THE COURT: And they --11 12 THE CLERK: (INAUDIBLE) side door. 13 THE COURT: So, they are not using --14 THE CLERK: (INAUDIBLE). They are only in the 15 front. 16 ATTY. PATTIS: I got here at 9:05. I came up at 17 9:30, so I know he was out there. 18 THE COURT: Right. But they are not using that 19 entrance (INAUDIBLE). Okay, and you didn't get any 20 notes, right, Ron? 21 THE CLERK: I haven't seen the jury yet today. 22 THE COURT: Oh. 23 THE CLERK: I'm sorry, Judge. I just got a text 24 from the chief marshal that there is a press 25 conference going on right now. 26 THE COURT: That's fine. 27 ATTY. PATTIS: Very well. As we speak.

1 ATTY. MATTEI: I understand that what Mr. Jones 2 said in substance this morning after promoting his 3 book was that the default is a lie. And, also, 4 describe, you know, a history of false flags. I 5 didn't see it. This is what was related to me. 6 ATTY. PATTIS: (INDISCERNIBLE). 7 ATTY. MATTEI: False flags. 8 So --9 ATTY. PATTIS: At the trial? 10 ATTY. MATTEI: As I said, I didn't see it. But 11 this is part of the reason we think an offer of proof 12 is going to be necessary. 13 ATTY. PATTIS: Well, I'm not -- Texas counsel 14 thinks this is a sanctions hearing on the grounds 15 that he asks questions designed and intended to hold 16 (INDISCERNIBLE). I don't intend to do that. 17 THE COURT: I didn't imagine you would. ATTY. PATTIS: No. I --18 THE COURT: It didn't even occur to me that you 19 20 would. 21 ATTY. PATTIS: No. I'm -- but I'm just --22 THE COURT: Really. That's it. 23 ATTY. PATTIS: Yeah. I mean, I don't think I'm 24 going to get permission to lead him to avoid that. 25 I know what the rules are. I think typically 26 (INDISCERNIBLE) can't avoid them. THE COURT: This is long (INDISCERNIBLE). 27

1 ATTY. PATTIS: I know what the rules are. 2 my client will make his choices. And the Court and 3 counsel will do what they think justice requires. I 4 have made it clear what the Court's position is and, 5 candidly, in my view, (INDISCERNIBLE) took liberties 6 that I was surprised were tolerated --7 THE COURT: Well, Attorney Pattis --8 ATTY. PATTIS: -- in cross-examination. 9 THE COURT: But, Attorney Pattis, I did not have 10 a contempt hearing when he started --ATTY. PATTIS: I know. 11 12 THE COURT: -- the plaintiffs ambulance chasers. I was going to raise that as an issue before he 13 14 testifies, and that he read into that that we are not 15 going to tolerate any further behavior. So --16 ATTY. PATTIS: (INAUDIBLE). 17 THE COURT: I would have been well within my 18 rights to hold him in contempt -- criminal contempt. ATTY. PATTIS: Judge, you can imagine a universe 19 20 in which a cautious lawyer might have said something. 21 THE COURT: Right. 22 ATTY. PATTIS: (INDISCERNIBLE). 23 ATTY. STERLING: Your Honor, I think one of the 24 reasons, though, why we need an offer of proof is 25 because we need to -- well, there are some other 26 issues here in terms of, as I understand Attorney Pattis, there is a door-opening argument, and the 27

1 scope of that, I think is something that needs to be 2 addressed. I believe that Attorney --3 ATTY. PATTIS: (INDISCERNIBLE). 4 ATTY. STERLING: I believe that part of the 5 door-opening argument may depend on the testimony of the corporate designee, and we would have a response 6 7 to that, which is the corporate designee binds the 8 corporation. So, I do think that it's something that 9 we may need to spend some time on. 10 I also wanted to say, Your Honor, that I may duck out before the jury comes in and I just didn't 11 12 want to -- I won't say anything over there but I 13 didn't want to be rude. 14 THE COURT: Okay. Okay. 15 ATTY. PATTIS: All right, Judge. 16 (END SIDEBAR). 17 THE COURT: Why don't we get the jury, Ron. 18 (COUNSEL CONFERRING). 19 (JURY ENTER). 20 THE COURT: Good morning. Good morning. Good 21 morning, on this rainy, Tuesday day. Welcome back, 22 everyone. Good morning. Good morning. 23 Counsel will stipulate that our entire panel of 24 nine has returned? 25 ATTY. MATTEI: Yes, Your Honor. 26 ATTY. PATTIS: Yes, Judge. 27 THE COURT: On time, as always. And we

1 appreciate that. 2 Please be seated. Make yourselves as 3 comfortable as you can when Ron hands out your 4 notepads. Ron has not brought to my attention any notes 5 from any of you, so I will continue to assume that 6 7 there have been no issues, but if and when you have 8 any issues with anything that you've encountered that 9 needs to be brought to my attention, I know you'll 10 follow the rule that I set out, and I will deal with 11 it appropriately. 12 All right. 13 Whenever you are ready, Attorney Mattei? 14 ATTY. MATTEI: Thank you, Your Honor. 15 The plaintiffs call Francine Wheeler. 16 THE COURT: Very well. 17 Good morning. Just watch your step there. 18 And just remain standing and Mr. Ferraro will 19 swear you in. 20 THE CLERK: Please raise your right hand. 21 22 23 24 25 26

1 FRANCINE WHEELER, 2 having been called as a witness, was duly sworn, 3 testified as follows: 4 THE WITNESS: I do. THE CLERK: Thank you. You may be seated. 5 6 I just need for you to state your name, slowly 7 spelling your last name for the record, and the state 8 and county you live in. 9 THE WITNESS: Okay. Francine Wheeler, 10 W-h-e-e-l-e-r, Fairfield, Connecticut. Fairfield 11 County, Connecticut. 12 THE COURT: Okay. If you need to refill your 13 water bottle, of course you help yourself at any 14 time. All right. 15 And you may inquire, Attorney Mattei, whenever 16 you are ready. 17 ATTY. MATTEI: Thanks very much, Your Honor. DIRECT EXAMINATION BY ATTY. MATTEI: 18 19 Good morning, Francine. Good morning everybody. Q 20 Good morning. Α 21 Francine, let's do a quick introduction to the jury. 22 You are married to David, who is here who testified earlier 23 in the case; yes? 24 Α Yes. 25 And have been for a long time? 0 26 Friday will be 21 years. Α And you are mom to Ben Wheeler? 27

A Yes.

- Q And also Nate, and Matt; right?
- A That's correct.
- Q All right. So, as we've been doing with all the folks who are here, we've been trying to give the jury a sense of your background, and who you are as a person, and so I would just like you to please give the jury a sense of that, where you grew up, what your family life is like, where you went to school, that kind of thing?
- A So, I grew up outside of Philadelphia, in a very loud, Italian family, the only girl with three brothers, kind of strict Catholic at the time, kind of lapsed later, but we were funny, we were artistic, we played music, we sang together. My mom is an artist. And, ironically, we lived near Newtown Square, that's where I was born, and then we moved to another county outside of Philadelphia, and I went to school in Newtown, Pennsylvania, and later on, ended up in Newtown, Connecticut. So, at the time when I graduated from high school in Newtown, PA. I went to Allentown College of St. Francis DeSales, which is a long name, but a very tiny little school where I majored in theater and French -- double major.
 - Q Francine, can I stop you for a second?
- A Yeah.
 - Q You mentioned that you grew up in a big, loud,

 Italian family, that there was a lot of singing. Tell the

 jury a little bit about singing, because I understand that's

a large part of what you do, and how did that -- how did you get into that?

A Well, when kids learn to talk when they are like a year, I was learning to sing. I had always sung. I have been a singer my whole life. I've done other things too with singing, but singing is kind of the core of who I am. And I was about five when my mom said, I think you are going to a singer, because that's all I wanted to do all day and night. My older brothers, much to their chagrin, were listening to me sing Annie over, and over, and over, and over again when I was 13 forever. And then, you know, I got serious about it. I learned to play piano, and I was just wanting to be a performer.

- Q You said you have three brothers?
- A Mm-hmm.

- Q Is your family all still down in the Philly area?
- A They are all still down in Philly. My parents are still living, and my brothers are all within an hour to fifteen minutes of them. And they think I live in, like, Utah or Europe because I'm so far away from them, but I see them a lot. I see them a lot.
- Q So, tell me again. You went to St. Francis DeSales College?
 - A Mm-hmm. It's now called DeSales University.
 - Q In Allentown?
 - A Right outside of Allentown. Yeah.
- Q Okay. And when you -- when did you graduate?

- A 1989.
- 2 Q Okay.

- A A long time ago. Yeah.
- Q And when you graduated, did you try to make a go of it in singing and the arts?
 - A Yeah. So, my parents redid -- my mom redid my bedroom curtains thinking I would move home, but I said I'm -- my friend got me a singing/waitressing job at Mrs. J's Sacred Cow on 72nd and Broadway, so I'm going to move to New York.
 - Q When you say, singing waitress, are those two different jobs or is it the same job?
 - A Well, it was two things that I had to do, not at the same time. I didn't, like, serve the food and sing, but I served the food and then I would get up a sing a song, and that kind of thing. And I got an agent that way. It kind of started my career in New York, so --
 - Q Was it in Manhattan?
 - A Manhattan. Upper West Side. I lived in a lot of different apartments because I would leave the city and go and do a job. You know, like, I played Maria in West Side Story, and I, you know, I did a lot of parts like that. It wasn't until later that I focused on commercials, and singing mostly, like, singing commercials and singing with my band that happened later.
 - Q Okay. David mentioned that -- I think he mentioned that when he met you, you were singing as part of a Swing --

A Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

Q -- like Jazz outfit?

I had a Trio called Swing Set. And if you are -- if you are old enough to remember, or if not, in the '90s Swing music was very big. And during that time, I thought that if I sang with the big band, I would get a lot of work, and we did. And we recorded music, and we performed every week on 46th Street and 8th Avenue, and we had a great A cappella group. So, what happened, was that we had been doing gigs for a while, and my roommate said to me, you know, I know these sketch comedy guys, Ward and Wheeler, and they are looking for a music act for their next variety show, and I said, well, what does it pay? Because for me, it was about how much money I could make because it was a tough business to be in. And she said, well, I don't know what it's going to pay but it could be good exposure. So, I told the girls, and I said, what do you think? Should we do this gig? It's going to be on the Upper West Side, at Citrus Grill, with these guys, I don't know them. And they are, like, well, you know, let's just do it. So, long story short, we did the gig, and I meet this guy who is this kind of goofy, funny guy named David, and I notice that he's really a good quitarist. I said, you know, David, I have an audition next week for this folk musical and I need a guitarist, would you be interested in playing for me? And he said, sure. he -- I hired him, we rehearsed the song, we did the audition, and after the audition I got a letter in the mail,

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

and it was this card, and it had a picture of me kind of singing, and him playing guitar. And I was, like, oh my gosh, that looks like David and that looks like me. And I was, like, oh my God, that is us. And my roommate said, well, he totally likes you. And I thought, oh my gosh, I think I like him. But I kind of got excited. And then my phone rang later, and it was David, and I was so excited because I thought he was going to ask me out. And he said, hey, Francine, it's David, listen, um -- I was like, yeah. I, uh -- I was wondering, Dave -- Jamie and I have a gig this Friday. And I was, like, yeah. Would you work the door for us? And I was, like, okay. And I thought, I am really desperate, because I was almost 31 and I had made peace with the fact that I was probably not going to get married because I had spent my life up until that moment really focused on performing, and I didn't really, either -you know, I just didn't have time anymore, and I didn't know if I ever wanted to settle down. But after I met David, and I worked the door that Friday, I kind of knew. It was a weird feeling. And it makes me kind of happy/sad, but I hadn't even kissed him yet, and I knew I had fallen in love with him. And it was kind of a magical time because we didn't -- we were so busy, we didn't even go on our first date for a couple of months after that but I knew I was going to marry him. I didn't tell him that because I didn't want to scare him off, but I knew.

When he was testifying, he said that, you know, once

you and he -- and it sounds like you came to this realization very quickly thought -- once the two of you realized you wanted to be together, he described it as just looking at green lights all the way down for the two of you. How did you see it once the two of you decided that you were just going to be together?

A It was probably within -- about six months into our relationship I knew that we were going to be together -- or he knew by then. And the way we look at it was, it was the timing was right because we were not just in love, but we were both kind of tired of the business, and we both wanted to have marriage and kids. Like, it was just something that I knew I wanted to do and didn't before that. I just could see us being a family. So, it was kind of, like, we just made it happen. And it was easy. It was always easy then.

Q And over time, as you guys were figuring out getting out of the business, I figure that's why you ended up looking to move out of the city to somewhere else?

A Well, I always say I left the business but I never really did, because I have this kids band at the time, too. A lot of things happened. I did a lot of different performing. We were going to try -- we were looking near Philly to be near my family, but I said to Dave that I kind of want to be near New York, you know, just in case I still want to sing sometimes, you know. And he said, sure. So, we kept looking near New York, but we were struggling performers, and we couldn't afford any place, and we had

- 1 these friends who had moved to this place called Sandy Hook.
- 2 And they said, you know, come up here. It's only like an
- 3 hour and a half from New York. And it was the first place
- 4 that we could afford to settle and it had really good
- 5 schools. And I'm kind of skipping ahead because we had kids
- 6 in the City first before we moved, but --
- 7 Q That's Nate and Ben?
 - A Nate and Ben. Yeah.
- 9 Q When did you move?

- 10 A We moved in 2007, in April, and then by July we
- 11 rented a little, tiny house, and then by July, we bought our
- 12 house in Sandy Hook. And Nate was four, and Benny was about
- eight and nine months old.
- Q Okay. All right. So, let's go there next. Nate is
- 15 Ben's older brother, separated by a little over three years?
- 16 A Yeah. A little over three years.
- 17 Q And how old is Nate now?
- 18 A Nate is 19 and a half.
- 19 Q So, you all move out to Sandy Hook. Tell the jury
- 20 about Ben. You know what I mean? We heard a little bit
- about the teeth from David.
- 22 A Oh, yeah. The biting.
- 23 Q The biting. But I want -- tell the jury, from your
- perspective, about Benny growing up, what he was like?
- 25 A Well, he had -- he had a Lobis face. That's my
- 26 maiden name, Lobis. And he had this big, bright smile, and
- 27 rosy cheeks, and he was funny. He was such a funny boy.

And he was kind of my Koala bear. Like, he was my kid that if I left the room, he would be, like, where did you go, come back. You know, but he also showed signs early early on that he was musical.

I tell this story that we were leaving the doctor's office one day, we were in the elevator, and we left, and we go in the car, and he said, momma, what's that C for in the elevator? And I said, oh, C is usually for like the center floor kind of thing. And he said no, no, no, no. Not that letter, but -- and he hummed a C. Which I'm not perfect pitch, but it was like hmmm. And I said, what? And he said, yeah, the C, hmmm. And so I went home with him and I started saying, sing me a G. And he could sing a G. And he just could sing notes out of the air. And during that time, he was also very obsessed with lighthouses. So, he had to visit lighthouses whenever we moved somewhere, or whenever we -- I mean, not moved somewhere, whenever we went on vacation. We had to visit, we had to tour lighthouses. He had to have a lighthouse on his birthday cake. We had lighthouses all over his and Nate's room. And he was so busy. He never sat. So, he would just run, run. Right before he died, he had started to settle down, but we had a -- we had a sticker chart, and one of them was --

- Q Meaning, you get a sticker if you do something good?
- 26 A Yeah.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

27

Q Okay.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

```
So, he had, like, one that was, like, sitting fully
in a chair. That was his biggest accomplishment. He
finally did that but, no kicking, licking, or biting, was
like a two out of five. Like, he really couldn't -- he did
that a lot, so.
            ATTY. MATTEI: Pritika, can we show a picture of
       Ben?
             This is, Your Honor, Exhibit 560. It's a new
       exhibit.
            ATTY. PATTIS: 560, sir?
            ATTY. MATTEI: Yeah. I believe it's without
       objection.
            ATTY. PATTIS: No objection.
       So, you are talking about lighthouses. So, this
   0
is --
   Α
       That's Nauset Light in Massachusetts.
       And that's Ben?
   0
       Yeah.
       Do you know when about that might have been taken?
       I think that was 2011. It could have been the summer
   Α
of 2012, I'm not sure. It was either 2011 or 2012. He was
about -- yeah, he was five, so it must have been about 2012.
       What did he like about lighthouses?
       He liked getting to the top of them and seeing out
into the ocean. I'm pretty sure that we saw a whale when we
were in Massachusetts or, you know, we were at the top. He
liked hearing the history and how people would bring in the
```

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

boats safely. He was loving that captain feeling, like being the beacon, the one that could, you know, stand at the top and help the boats.

Q What was -- before he died. So, you know, around this time, 2011, 2012, what was his relationship with Nate like?

So, they were very different boys, but they were best friends. That Nate was always reading, Ben always wanted to be outside. So, we would try and get Ben to sit and read a little bit, and we would try and get Nate out of the house a little bit. And, Benny, even at a very young age, even when he had just turned six a couple months before he died, he was helping Nate get out of his shell because Nate was such an introvert and Ben was, like, come on, Nate, we are going to do this, and we are going to do that, and come on outside. And he had this kind of high-pitched, very, you know, sing-songy voice, and he would convince Nate and nobody else could. You know, so, they had that beautiful -like, I could picture them as grown men being best men at each other's weddings, or Benny visiting Nate at college before he would go. And I just knew that they were best friends, and I never worried about them having a playmate because they always had each other. In fact, Ben was so excited about Nate, I had to stop Ben. He would poke Nate's eyelids in the morning to get him awake. And I would say, you know, you can't wake up your brother Nate. If you do, I'm going to have to put you in another room.

```
1
      please, mommy, don't put me in a different room. I love
 2
      Nate. You know, so, he did finally stop poking his eyes,
 3
      but it took a while.
 4
              Did they share a room?
              They did.
 5
          Α
 6
              So, moving into 2012, Francine. I want to show you
 7
      another picture just to -- so we can orient the jury in
 8
      time.
 9
                   ATTY. MATTEI: This is 315.
10
                    This is by agreement, Your Honor. Already in,
              I believe.
11
12
                   ATTY. PATTIS: Agreed.
13
                   ATTY. MATTEI: You can pull that up. Thank you.
14
              So, here we are. When was this picture taken,
15
      Francine?
16
              This was just, literally, maybe, a few days, could
17
      have been as long as a week before the shooting, because we
18
      took that picture quickly on the phones -- one of our
19
      phones -- to make a Christmas card.
20
          0
              Okay.
21
              Yeah.
22
              That's Nate in the red and Ben in the green?
          Q
23
          Α
              That's right.
24
              This is at your home?
          Q
25
              Yup. Right in front of the stairs. Mm-hmm.
          Α
26
              Okay.
          Q
27
                   ATTY. MATTEI: Thank you, Pritika. You can take
```

it down.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

Q Francine, I want you to tell the jury about that morning, the morning of the shooting, and the time that you spent with Ben that day before you sent him off to school?

So, usually, Nate and Ben would get on the bus like normal, and that morning, David and I were rushing, and I said to David, you know, Benny has a little bit of a cough, should we send him to school, what do you think? And he said, oh, he'll be fine, so David left. And unbeknownst to me, he had taken Nate and Ben's backpacks with him because we were switching cars that morning. And when the boys realized that, I said, don't worry, Ben, I'm going to write to Mrs. D'Amato and I'll tell her, you know. And then I said, oh my gosh, guys, I forgot, Nate has Book Club. We've got to get Natie to school. So, I quickly cleaned up, and as I'm stacking the dishwasher, Ben turns to me and he says, mommy, what does forgiveness mean? And I was, like, I don't know, Ben, I'm so busy. No, no. Mommy, mommy, what's forgiveness mean? And I said, I don't know, Ben, it's like when you do something wrong, the other person forgets about it, now come on we got to go. So, we pack up the bags, we get in the car, we drop off Nate at Sandy Hook, and I said to Ben, okay, so, what do you want to do, do you want to go home and wait for the bus, or do you want to go to Starbucks for a treat?

- A He said, Starbucks, of course.
- Q And Nate was in third grade?

- A Nate was in fourth grade.
- Q Fourth grade?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

A And Ben was in first.

So, we go to Starbucks. He orders a chocolate milk, I get my coffee, we sit down, and he literately turns to me and he says, you know what, momma, I'm going to be an architect when I grow up. And I was, like, wow, okay, that's great. He said, no, no, wait. I'm going to be an architect and a paleontologist because Nate is going to be a paleontologist and I have to do everything that Nate does. And I said, well, you know, you are your own person, you don't have to do whatever Nate does. And he said, oh, no, no. I'm always going to be with Nate. I love Nate and I love you, mommy. And I said, I love you too. You know, it's so nice. We never get to be here together you and me. We are always rushing around. And then he said, mommy, I said, yeah, and he said, can I have your iPhone. So, I gave him the iPhone. A few minutes later, I said, all right, buddy, come on, we got to pack up everything and go to school. So, it was about 9 o'clock, and he was so excited to go into school when I was dropping him off around the front, he left the door open, and I said, Benny, close the And I don't remember if I said I love you, but I remember saying close the door. That was the last thing I said to him, and then he went in.

Those moments you spent with Ben at Starbucks, just

the two of you, has that become a cherished memory of yours?

A Yes. Everybody knows that story who knows us. Yeah.

Q As we've been doing with most folks, I'm not going to have you walk me through the rest of that day, but I do want to talk to you, Francine, about the week thereafter. Nate was, obviously, in school though?

A Nate was hiding in a box of T-shirts in the supply closet, in the gym, listening to the murders. He heard everything. He was there. If the shooter had turned right instead of left, he would be gone probably.

Q In the days after, I understand that you and David, obviously, have a lot of support from friends and family to come help?

A We had five years in Newtown and we have had, and have, a community. And, so, they immediately swarmed in and helped us kind of get through -- I mean, I think, press was there by the end of the day before I even officially heard that Ben was gone, so I was having them kind of deal with the press immediately. And by the next day, my friend who was in my singing band with me back in the '90s, one of my closest friends, she was -- she came in and kind of took charge of everything to help with the onslaught of people, and craziness, and the phone ringing. And I had a home number at that time, and it kept ringing.

Q David described that at some point, relatively soon after the shooting, people had come to the house claiming -- wanting to see Ben --

A Yeah.

Q -- and falsely claiming to be a reporter, and that one of your friends had helped manage that situation. Is that the same friend you are talking about?

A Yes.

- Q And what's her name?
- A Kim.
- Q In the days after the shooting, when did you first learn that there was a lie that had been pushed by Alex Jones concerning what happened to your son, what was happening to you, and these other families?

ATTY. PATTIS: Objection to the form. Compound.

THE COURT: Overruled.

A Benny died on Friday the 14th. By Monday, Kimmy came to us and said, one of the dads of one of the kids who died, his name is Robbie Parker, and he did a press conference, and they are saying things about Robbie that aren't true and there is this guy out there who is saying that Sandy Hook didn't happen, and now they are bombarding Robbie, this dad, with this stuff, and on his page, on his daughter's page. But it was very -- it was probably a few weeks of Kimmy talking to us about it, and I pretty much said, stop, I don't want to know, I can't handle anything right now. All I -- you know, but she did say it very early on. And that she was working behind the scenes to try and keep it away from us as much as possible.

Q And when you heard this, I take it -- it sounds like your response was just to say, I don't want to even know

about Alex?

A I don't want to know. I didn't want to know. Also, you know, I didn't want to know anything about the crime, and I didn't know if I could handle the next minute, so I just wanted to deal with the minute, and I didn't want to know anything outside. I didn't look on the television, I didn't look on the internet. I created a kind of -- I think even David knew more than I did. I just kept a very small room for things.

- O When was Ben's funeral?
- A His visitation was Wednesday night the 19th and his funeral was Thursday morning, December 20th.
 - Q That was at Trinity Episcopal Church in Newtown?
 - A Yes. I was a member of the Trinity. Mm-hmm.
- Q Did you hear Bill Aldenberg testify in this case that he was assigned to provide security at Benny's funeral?
- A Yes, but I didn't know. Because that was the funeral -- that was the only funeral at Trinity Episcopal Church was Benny's. I didn't know there was death threats. Kim told me later that was true. I didn't know at the time.
 - Q Moving forward into the first months of 2013 -Are you okay?
- Moving forward into the first months of 2013, did you, over time, although you were trying to keep yourself in that bubble, start to become aware more about this lie that was being pushed?
 - A Yes. Nate was asked, because he was in fourth grade,

and the third and fourth graders were asked to sing in the Sandy Hook choir at the Super Bowl in New Orleans.

Q In February of 2013?

A That was February of 2013. And at the time, I was still pretty insulated. I didn't know what was really out there, but I remember being nervous about Nate's safety, and my safety, and David's safety. We went to the Super Bowl, and during the Super Bowl, the lights and the electricity went out during the game, and I was pretty terrified that this was the end, that people were going to come hurt us. But it was after the Super Bowl when I actually started to understand something different that was going on.

Q And is that because you became aware that Nate had learned about this lie that his brother's death was a hoax?

A Yeah. I was trying to keep it from him. He wasn't yet -- he didn't have a phone. He was very limited. He was only nine and a half. And, so, I found out that there was a boy in the choir that they were saying was Ben. And I started to see some of the comments after the Super Bowl and, that we were actors, and that there was this bunch of people who didn't believe that Sandy Hook happened, because look, there is Ben in the choir, Nate's brother, and I was terrified that Nate was going to find out, because I felt like I can ignore this, but I can't have Nate see it. But Natie went on a play date one day, I think it was before his birthday, like, in April, and his friend showed him everything on the internet, and all of the lies they were

saying about David and I being actors, and that Ben was alive, that he didn't even exist. That Nate was lying at the Super Bowl. And he asked me, he said, why are people saying this, Mom? I didn't know what to say to him.

I mean, I have to say this, because it's really important that, when I say this out loud, I have to also remind myself of this which is, it is one thing to lose a child. There are thousands and thousands of parents who have lost children to guns, to cancer, to many many things, and that's hard enough because you learn to live — if you are a grieving parent, you learn to live with that. It's quite another thing when people take everything about your boy who is gone, and your surviving child, and your husband, and everything you ever did in your life that is on the internet, and harass you, and make fun of you, because that's something I can't — I can't fix. I can't make that better for Nate. I can't do that. Forever he has that.

- Q Francine, I want to show you Exhibit 297 which is in evidence as a photo produced by Free Speech Systems. Do you see this photo, Francine?
 - A Yes.

- Q And this is a picture of surviving children of Sandy Hook performing at the Super Bowl in New Orleans; right?
 - A Yes.
 - Q And --

26 ATTY. MATTEI: Yeah. Keep going, Pritika.
27 Thanks.

```
1
                    I'm going to go --
 2
                   Your Honor, may I go over here? I just don't
 3
              want to jam in over here.
 4
                   THE COURT: Certainly.
              You can look at your screen, Francine. But you see
 5
 6
      here, this is your son, Nate?
 7
          Α
              Yes.
 8
              Okay. Then, here it says, ten Sandy Hook children
 9
      found alive and well, and they describe another child here,
10
      Owen Wright, aka Ben Wheeler; right?
11
          Α
              Yes.
12
              Who had died three months before?
13
          Α
              That's what it says.
14
                   ATTY. MATTEI: And you can pull out of that,
15
              please.
16
              And then here we have Emilie Parker, also according
17
      to this, singing at the Super Bowl. Do you see here,
18
      Francine, this young boy, Jake Hockley?
19
              Yes. That's Jake.
          Α
20
              Dylan's brother?
          0
21
              Yes.
          Α
22
              Do you see down here, Jesse Lewis; right?
          Q
23
          Α
              That's --
24
              Jesse Lewis was killed in Sandy Hook, wasn't he?
          Q
25
              That's right. That's not Jesse.
          Α
26
              Is this what Nate was shown by his friend?
          Q
27
              Yes. And a lot of comments, and a lot of -- I
```

```
1
      believe -- a lot of doctored videos of David and me as well.
 2
              You've seen a video of Mr. Jones' broadcast in which
 3
      he described pictures of children who they say are dead who
      are still alive?
 4
              Yes. I've seen that video.
 5
          Α
 6
                   ATTY. MATTEI: Can we pull up, please,
 7
              Mr. Jones' deposition? It's Exhibit 372.
                    One moment, Your Honor, and I'll get this
 8
 9
              exhibit number. This will be 372H, Your Honor.
10
                    I'll offer it as part of Mr. Jones' deposition
11
              testimony, page 317, 318.
12
                    You can pull it up, please?
13
              QUESTION: When you say you have a photo of a bunch of
14
      kids who are still alive that they say died, what photo are
15
      you talking about?
16
              ANSWER: I don't remember which one that is.
17
              QUESTION: Are you talking about the Super Bowl photo
18
      that Mr. Halbig sent you?
19
              ANSWER: That might be it.
20
                    You said that --
21
                   ATTY. MATTEI: You can take that down.
22
              Francine, you said that this was kind of happening in
23
      the months after the Super Bowl and that Nate asked you why
24
      this was happening; right?
25
          Α
              Yes.
26
              You were here during opening statements?
27
          Α
              Yes.
```

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

You see that in April, Mr. Jones published a video which he titled, Crisis Actors Used at Sandy Hook: Special Report? Α Yes. ATTY. MATTEI: I would like to pull up 8B. Your Honor, this is a still shot of that broadcast which is currently in as 8A. ATTY. PATTIS: This is a new exhibit? ATTY. MATTEI: This is a photo of a video that is in evidence. So, it's a still shot of that video. ATTY. PATTIS: So, it is a new exhibit? ATTY. MATTEI: Correct. ATTY. PATTIS: Okay. No Objection, Judge. THE COURT: So ordered. And I'm just going to show you a still shot of that broadcast entitled, Crisis Actors Used At Sandy Hook: Special Report, published in April. April 1, 2013. ATTY. MATTEI: Thank you. After -- in the months after Ben's death, did friends of yours start an organization to try to honor Ben? They actually started it only a few days after the shooting. And it was my community at my church. They put together this idea that they wanted to do something for youth, and they wanted to honor Ben, so I said, we should call it Ben's Lighthouse because he loved lighthouses, and what a beautiful way to remember him. You know, because the symbol of being a beacon. So, they started it to do

something. And I say that very loosely, because we did a lot of things then. I didn't start it, so they were doing, like, volunteer work with children, and they would go to different places where they had trauma, and they would help them rebuild houses, and they would, you know, just help different communities. So, early on, after the shooting, before I had some other things that I needed to take care of and do, they ran it for probably a good two years before I became more involved.

Q One of the things -- well, during that time period, that two-year time period, you and David decided to try and have another child?

A Yes. We were already older parents, and I used to talk to Ben, and I would say, Benny, I know that I can do this, but I need you to help me because I'm 45 years old. And we found a way to have a baby. And I spent most of, probably from the fall of 2013 all the way through Matthew's birth in November, 2014, just focused on that: Getting pregnant, going through the pregnancy, and all of the hard things about being pregnant at such an older age, and then having a healthy baby in November of 2014. So, that was really my focus. That's why my friends were running Ben's Lighthouse for me, and that's why I -- and I insulated myself during that time. I still didn't watch -- from the fall of 2013 and through 2014, I did not do much looking, much involvement of things.

Q Matthew was born in late November, 2014?

- A November 5th, 2014.
- Q After the months after the shooting, as part of your coming to terms with what happened, did you participate in a radio address?
- A Yes.

- Q What was that?
 - A It was in April of 2013. And during that time, between January and probably May -- May/June, I thought that if we had a moment, because I thought people were going to forget about Sandy Hook, so I thought, I wanted to tell the public that I don't want other parents to go through what I went through. And, so, I was asked by President Obama to do his radio address before a vote for expanded background checks in the senate.
 - Q After shootings, one of the things that you felt was important to do, is to help protect other children if you could?
 - A Yes.
 - Q And, so, you supported background checks?
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 Q After you had Matt --
- A Mm-hmm.
- Q -- and going into 2015, is that when you decided that you wanted to take a more active role in Ben's Lighthouse?
 - A Yes. I sort of, with this new baby, I felt like I had a renewed energy to kind of go back into the world a little bit and start to figure out not to -- I call it kind

of like not erasing what happened, not forgetting Ben, but actually learning to live with my grief and with my joy of having this new baby, and my surviving son, and that I could create a new life that was different. Kind of like being born again, but not in a religious sense, more in a living sense. And, so, I got involved with Ben's Lighthouse, and I started to become much more aware of the world around me.

Q Can you tell the jury when you became more involved in Ben's Lighthouse, and you were thinking about ways to make it successful in the work that it wanted to do --

By the way, and what is the work that Ben's Lighthouse, real quickly? We'll get to it a little bit later, but just so that everybody knows what it is that Ben's Lighthouse does.

A Well, our mission has worked with youth to help them develop self-awareness so that they can -- we call it, find and share your light. And, so, finding and sharing your light has to do with becoming -- it's a social/emotional work that we do in our programming to help kids understand themselves, and understand the world, to build stronger communities.

- Q Find and share your light like the lighthouse?
- A Yeah. We use literal symbols.
- Q That makes it easier for kids.
- A Yes. Yes.

Q But as you were starting to try and get in that work and make sure that you could do the work that you wanted to

do, did you start to become aware of the extent to which Alex Jones' lies about Sandy Hook had spread?

A Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- Q Can you describe that, please?
- Α It was then, that all those people who had been running Ben's Lighthouse, started to tell me about the phone calls, and the e-mails, and the website, and the social media, and our pages, and everything being attacked all the time, and that they were trying to hide it from me. Everybody was always trying to keep it from me so that it wouldn't interfere with my life. And, so, they said, so, you know, we are always trying to get people more visits to the website, but we are having trouble because of all that's out there, and that is when I started to investigate what was going on out there and I started to Google my name. And that's when I was very -- I remember distinctly not just looking at having a friend trying to help me, but she had a friend at Google who helped me clear my name so that we could get my name connected to Ben's Lighthouse.
- Q So, let's just explain that. So, the idea is that if somebody kind of seen you being associated with Ben's Lighthouse and Googled you, when they did that, they wouldn't find Ben's Lighthouse, they would find all this other stuff before you being a --
 - A A crisis actor.
 - Q -- a crisis actor.
- A Mm-hmm.

Q And, so, you went to a friend of yours to see if you could make it so that the search results would actually show Ben's Lighthouse rather than these lies but?

A Right. Right.

Q Okay. Go ahead.

A So, she did. And we got my name cleared. It was a miracle. And then, I don't know, it could have been a couple weeks, maybe a month, I have no idea, but it was very shortly after that, it went right back to "crisis actor" and that clearing that happened, they just — they couldn't make it stop.

Q And tell the jury, as you were looking at this, your friend, Kim, had told you, including very shortly after the shooting, that Alex Jones had started lying about this. In encountering this stuff online, did you come to a greater appreciation for Alex Jones and his role in this?

A I remember some time in 2015, one night I couldn't sleep, and I watched all of his videos. I wanted to know what he was saying. I wanted to know how he was describing Sandy Hook, why he was saying it, what his show was about. I wanted to know because I couldn't figure out how this happened, and so I watched them all. I watched them all. I've seen all the videos.

Q And you told the jury that you have, obviously, done some performing when you were younger. As you were looking online, tell the jury beyond seeing comments about you being an actor and seeing -- tell the jury what happened to you,

```
1
      personally? What were you seeing what was happening with
 2
      your online stuff you had done?
 3
              Well, isn't it -- it's kind of ironic, because I
 4
      spent my adult career being a performer but a real
      performer. I loved my life in New York, and I loved what I
 5
 6
      was doing. Even when I went to Newtown, I was still
 7
      performing in Newtown. And I had this preschool music
 8
      following, and I would bring my guitar to the library. I
 9
      mean, I've always performed, and they took my videos, and my
10
      work of 20 years, and they doctored them, and they made fun
      of them, and they said, look, see, she's an actor. And they
11
12
      took -- they took my identity. They took my identity, and
13
      then they took my husband's identity, they took my surviving
14
      child's identity who was hiding in the gym. They took it.
15
              And even when you tried to clean it up, within weeks,
16
      it was all right back up?
17
          Α
              Yes.
18
              I do want to show the jury a little bit more about
19
      Ben's Lighthouse.
20
                   ATTY. MATTEI: And this is -- these are Exhibits
21
              561, 562, and 563. These are new exhibits concerning
22
              Ben's Lighthouse. I believe there's no objection?
23
                   ATTY. PATTIS: That's correct, Judge. No
24
              objection.
25
                   ATTY. MATTEI: I would offer them, Your Honor.
26
                   THE COURT: So ordered.
              So, Francine, I just want you to spend a little time
27
```

talking together jury about Ben's Lighthouse.

ATTY. MATTEI: Let's pull up 561. Try 562. I might have given you the wrong order, Pritika. Sorry. I'm trying to get to the main page. 563. Yeah. I gave you the reverse order, sorry. 563. Okay. Here we go.

- Q All right. So, is this the main page for Ben's Lighthouse?
 - A Yes.

- Q Okay. The Isle of Skoo. Summer camp. This is what it looks like right now if you go to it; right?
 - A Yeah.
 - Q So, tell the jury what this is?

A So, during 2015, 2016, 2017, I thought, now that my friends have to kind of hand it over to me, what are you going to do, Francine? So, I have took our mission and I said, well, finding and sharing your light. Maybe I could make it more "Benesk". Maybe I could take that probably, perfect pitch boy who could play the piano, and add music because I know that. I know how to do that. So, I wrote a puppet show, program, and it's called The Isle of Skoo because I know Benny had many nicknames, but Skoo was one of my favorite nicknames for him. So, I created -- David designed puppets, and I made this little six-year old puppet lighthouse keeper, who is named Skoo, and he meets all these friends on this isle. And I kind of say that all the friends are different personalities, kind of like,

Winnie-the-Pooh or Sesame Street where you have somebody who is kind of grouchy and angry, and somebody who is shy, and somebody who is a perfectionist. And the children learn about Skoo. And Skoo is kind of like their audience. He asks all the questions that they are thinking. And we developed a camp of mentors and mentees, and now I teach the kids through this program and summer camp, how to find and share your light through music, song, puppetry, volunteerism, and it's still going strong, so.

Q Is the idea with these puppets, that children are able to see different ways to express their emotions and it's okay --

A Yes.

Q -- to express their emotions?

A It is. Because that's how you build community. And I thought, maybe -- I don't connect it to the tragedy; however, I do say that one of the ways that I have survived this, is through my amazing Newtown community, and so I want to teach kids about that importance, because that's how you survive something like this. You need those people, and you need to understand people's emotions, and imagine what it's like to be other people. I believe that sincerely.

Q Were you here for when we presented Mr. Jones testimony that he was telling his audience that the whole community of Newtown was in on it?

A Yes.

ATTY. MATTEI: Let's go to the mission page of

1 The Lighthouse. If we can just maybe read that. 2 That would be 562 I think. 3 Just pull up the Mission and Vision. 4 And Ben's Lighthouse offers The Isle of Skoo program that empowers children and teens to develop the 5 self-awareness, empathy, and social connections they need to 6 7 find and share their own light through music, puppetry, and 8 mentorship. We help young people find three unique ability 9 to make a difference in the world, to be beacons of hope and 10 change, to stand tall and shine bright. 11 And this is something that you found a way to 12 honor Ben? 13 Α Yes. 14 But, even today, and throughout it's existence, Ben's 15 Lighthouse has been targeted by people who believe you are 16 an actor and that Ben never existed; correct? 17 Α Correct. Yes. 18 And in addition to the online harassment that you've 19 encountered, has this lie, pushed by Alex Jones, made it's 20 way into your interactions with people? 21 Α Yes. 22 Can you describe what happened to you in May of 2016? 0 23 I attended a conference called Circle of Mothers. 24 It's about moms whose kids are killed by guns. And it's an 25 opportunity for moms to be with other mothers that know your 26 pain. Sometimes it's in a conference for helping mothers

seek help from Office of Victim Services, and to get your --

1 just to find the support and help that you need to move 2 forward. And, so, I was -- one of the moms from the 26 3 families said you might want to consider going, so I did. 4 The second day of the conference, I was in the elevator, and 5 there was this other woman standing there, and she was 6 sobbing. And I said, I'm so sorry, who did you lose? 7 she said, my 19-year old son. He was shot and killed, like 8 a robbery in a market, and it happened three weeks ago. And 9 I said, oh my gosh, that's so soon, I'm so sorry. And then 10 she looked at my necklace, and I have a picture of Ben. have Ben's ashes in a Treble Clef, and I have his picture. 11 12 And she said, who is that? And I said, that's my son, Ben. 13 He died in his first grade classroom at Sandy Hook School. And she said, what? And I said, yeah. He died at Sandy 14 15 Hook. And she said, you are lying. That didn't happen. 16 And I said, it did happen. She said, but they said it 17 didn't happen. They said it was all a lie. And I said, who 18 And she said, they said. And I said, no, it 19 happened. It really happened. She couldn't talk to me 20 after that. I don't know -- I-- I don't know what she 21 thought in that moment, but I told her it was true. 22 And this was a conference for mothers who lost 23 children, to help counsel one another through their loss? 24 Yes. Α Yes. 25 Francine, you talked earlier about the loss that you 26 suffered with losing Ben --27 Α Mm-hmm.

Q -- but, also, the additional experience you've had as you've tried to cope with that loss of living in the world where Alex Jones' lies have spread to such an extent. I want you to tell the jury what -- like, what have you done in response? How have you dealt with this phenomenon out there of people believing that you are an actor, that Ben never existed, that Nate's experience isn't real?

A Frankly, to be perfectly frank, the way that we deal with it is that we are in therapy, we have to have security in our house, we have to try and ignore, we have to be vigilant in our social media posts, we have to be vigilant on our website, we have to -- I get support from my community, whether it's emotional support. But it's hard to really describe, because I can never solve it, I can just kind of -- I think of it like plugging a hole where there is a, you know, a leak. But I can't -- I can't solve it, so I just have to -- I have to work through it all the time, through -- from my emotional work and help support my -- and also because my son is going to be eight soon. He just found out how Ben died, and I don't yet know how to tell him what's probably going to happen to him at some point because I don't know --

Q When people find out that he's Ben's brother?

A When they found out that he's Benny's brother, and he starts going online some day, whenever that is, he's going to have to handle it too. And I -- sometimes I worry, you know. My son, Nate, is at college and he remains as

1 anonymous as he can be because he doesn't want people to 2 know. 3 Have you tried to hide your identity as well? I often now use my middle name, Francine Lobis 4 5 Wheeler, so that it doesn't get as many bad hits as Francine 6 Wheeler. 7 You said you got home security. Why did you get home 8 security? What security system are you talking about? 9 The security system in our house. Because I know 10 that there is brain illness out there, and I know that some of these Sandy Hooksers, I've seen it, I've heard it, I've 11 12 read it. They could hurt us. I don't know. They could 13 hurt us. And we have this little boy at home, and we live 14 in the woods, and it's scary. 15 What are your fears for Nate? 16 Nate suffers from severe anxiety and other ailments 17 partly due to his trauma, partly due to this after-trauma 18 difficult time, difficult world that he has to navigate. 19 You are talking about the stuff that this case is 20 about? 21 So, I worry about him finding his own identity 22 and what that looks like, because I worry that he's never 23 really going to know how to really trust the world and 24 that's really sad.

A His best friend wasn't real. His best friend who was killed, wasn't real. His best friend that he heard get

If they tell him that his brother wasn't real?

25

26

```
1
      killed, wasn't real. That is -- that's devastating.
 2
      I'm worried for him.
 3
                   ATTY. MATTEI: That's all I have, Your Honor.
 4
              Thank you.
                   THE COURT: Attorney Pattis?
 5
 6
                   ATTY. PATTIS: May I have one moment, Judge?
 7
                   THE COURT: Take your time.
      CROSS-EXAMINATION BY ATTY. PATTIS:
 8
 9
              Miss Wheeler, I represent Alex Jones and Free Speech
10
      Systems, Inc., and I wanted to tell you I'm sorry for your
11
      loss.
12
              Thank you.
          Α
13
              You say you viewed all the videos that you could
14
      find.
             I presume, this was in 2015 or '16? My notes may be
      bad.
15
16
              I think it was 2015.
          Α
17
              And about how many of those were there?
          0
              I don't remember. At least a half a dozen.
18
19
              Prior to watching those videos of Mr. Jones, did you
20
      have any idea what his views were about guns, let's say?
21
          Α
              No.
22
              After watching those videos, did you have any view --
23
      idea of his views on guns?
24
              I don't think so. I'm not sure. My focus was on --
25
      I don't know is probably the best way I can answer that.
26
              Have you been present throughout the trial here --
          Q
27
              Yes.
```

```
1
              -- in Connecticut? Did you -- you've seen a video
 2
      where he said, "they are coming, they are coming, they are
 3
      coming --
 4
              Yes.
          Α
               -- they are coming for our guns" and he talked
 5
 6
      about the 2ND Amendment?
 7
          Α
              Yes.
 8
              Is that one of the videos you first saw when you
      studied his videos?
 9
10
          Α
            Yes.
              Viewing that, did that give you any idea about his
11
          Q
12
      views on guns?
13
          Α
              Yes.
14
            And why I believed -- why he asserted that Sandy Hook
15
      was a hoax?
16
                   ATTY. MATTEI: Objection, Your Honor.
17
                   ATTY. PATTIS: Why he asserted, not believed.
18
                   THE COURT: Sustained.
19
          Α
              Yes.
20
                   ATTY. PATTIS: Nothing further.
21
      REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY ATTY. MATTEI:
22
              Miss Wheeler, did you bring this lawsuit because
23
      Mr. Jones lied about you, your son, and these other
24
      families?
25
          Α
             Yes.
26
              Do you care at all what any of his views are on
27
      anything other than that?
```

1 Α No. 2 ATTY. MATTEI: I have nothing further, Your 3 Honor. 4 ATTY. PATTIS: Nothing further, Judge. THE COURT: You may step down. Just watch your 5 6 step. 7 Is this a good time for the morning recess? 8 ATTY. MATTEI: That would be fine, Your Honor. 9 If you would like to do that, that's fine. 10 THE COURT: All right. So, we will take our 11 15-minute recess, and we will come back, let's say, 12 11:35ish. All right. 13 So, Ron will be in charge of your notebooks, 14 and have a nice coffee break. 15 (JURY EXIT). 16 (MORNING RECESS). 17 (IN SESSION). 18 THE COURT: Good morning again, Marshal. Good 19 morning, everyone. 20 Are we ready for the jury? 21 ATTY. MATTEI: We are, Your Honor. 22 THE COURT: All right. 23 Mr. Ferraro, thank you, sir. 24 And, Counsel, you'll let me know when it's a 25 good time to deal with the issues we talked about the 26 on sidebar, whether we let the jurors go for an 27 earlier lunch, or return later from lunch, so that we

1 can do what you said -- or at the end of the day? 2 ATTY. PATTIS: No. I think the end. It's not 3 obvious to me that the plaintiffs will rest today, 4 and so the end of the day would make sense, Judge, 5 rather than the lunch break. 6 THE COURT: Okay. Just, you'll let me know. 7 ATTY. MATTEI: We'll be happy to let you know, Your Honor. And we can even take some guidance from 8 9 you on whether this is something that you'll want 10 some time to think about, because if so, we can do it earlier. I think we are both ready to go. 11 12 THE COURT: All right. Whatever. You two talk 13 and let me know when a good time is, and let's just 14 try and make it convenient for the jury. That's my 15 concern. 16 ATTY. MATTEI: Yup. 17 (JURY ENTER). 18 THE COURT: Okay. Welcome back. 19 Please be seated. 20 And counsel will stipulate that the entire 21 panel has returned? 22 ATTY. MATTEI: Yes, Your Honor. 23 ATTY. KOSKOFF: Yes, Your Honor. 24 THE COURT: All right. Attorney Mattei, whenever you are ready, you 25 26 may call your next witness. 27 ATTY. MATTEI: Thank you, Your Honor.

The plaintiffs will present the deposition testimony of Infowars E-Commerce Director, Timothy Fruge. THE COURT: And my prior instructions regarding videotaped deposition testimony applies again, of course.

1 (VIDEOTAPE DEPOSITION PLAYED OF TIMOTHY FRUGE). 2 (VIDEO STOPPED) 3 ATTY. MATTEI: Your Honor, one moment, please? 4 I think we may have skipped back. 5 You Honor, just one moment? I'm sorry. 6 THE COURT: Take your time. That's all right. 7 (VIDEOTAPE PLAYED). ATTY. MATTEI: That concludes Mr. Fruge's 8 9 testimony. 10 THE COURT: All right. So, I wonder if I can 11 make the same request for this videotape? 12 ATTY. MATTEI: Transcript? 13 THE COURT: Yeah. Because I could hear the 14 questions -- I could hear the answers very clearly, 15 but the questions are sort of a struggle for me. 16 There was, like, an echo and some background noise. 17 So, if you could, perhaps, file as an exhibit the 18 corresponding transcript like we did for the other 19 other? 20 ATTY. MATTEI: We will do that. Yut. 21 THE COURT: I appreciate that. 22 ATTY. MATTEI: We definitely will. Thank you, 23 Your Honor. 24 THE COURT: Okay. 25 All righty. You may call your next witness. 26 ATTY. MATTEI: Your Honor, before we do that, we 27 have one other video that we would like to play.

This is a video that has been market as Exhibit 592, aired on September 4, 2018, by Infowars as an episode of the Alex Jones show. We are showing a clip from that. This is Exhibit 592, September 4, 2018, concerning Google Analytics. ATTY. PATTIS: No objection. THE COURT: So ordered.

(EXHIBIT 592 PLAYED).
ATTY. KOSKOFF: Call Jackie Joven Barden.
THE COURT: Very well.
Good afternoon.
Be careful when you come up here.
And just remain standing, if you would?
THE CLERK: Please raise your right hand?

```
JACQUELINE BARDEN,
 1
 2
          having been called as a witness, was duly sworn,
 3
      testified as follows:
 4
                   THE WITNESS: I do.
 5
                   THE CLERK: Thank you.
 6
                   You may be seated.
 7
                   I just need you to state your name, slowly
 8
              spelling your last name for the record, and then the
 9
             county and state you live in? And just keep your
10
             voice up a little bit, please?
11
                   THE WITNESS: Jacqueline Barden, B-a-r-d-e-n,
12
             Fairfield County, Connecticut.
13
                   THE COURT: Thank you.
14
                   Just one moment. I'm going to wait for
15
             Attorney Pattis.
16
                   Do you need a moment, Attorney Pattis? Do you
17
             need a moment?
18
                   ATTY. PATTIS: No. I'm fine, Judge. I was just
19
             checking a file. That's all. Thank you.
20
                   THE COURT: Okay.
21
                   ATTY. KOSKOFF: Shall I proceed, Your Honor?
22
                   THE COURT: You may.
                   ATTY. KOSKOFF: Thank you.
23
24
      DIRECT EXAMINATION BY ATTY. KOSKOFF:
25
         Q Jackie. Thank you.
26
                   Good afternoon. Sounds so formal.
                   Jackie, could you tell the jury about your
27
```

1 background, where do you come from, and your lineage? 2 I grew up in the Bronx. Both my parents are 3 immigrants. They both are from Ireland. I'm the ninth of 4 ten children. My parents had a very very good relationship. 5 My father was -- worked in the A&P, and always had a second time job. And my mother, when I was little, she ended up 6 7 working as well. Yeah. 8 0 That's it? That's it. 9 10 You know, you said, the A&P? 0 11 Α Yeah. 12 That was a --0 13 Α Yeah. He always worked in a supermarket. 14 Q Okay. 15 He then always did something else. He was a garbage 16 collector on the side, he drove a cab, he cleaned the A&P. 17 I remember as a kid, me and my brother going, you know, 18 10 o'clock on a Friday night, he would be mopping the floors 19 and we would be running around the store. 20 Getting the floors all dirty. 21 And, so, how old was your -- if you know, how 22 old was your dad and mom when they came over to this 23 country? 24 I'm not sure. My father will be 100 next month. 25 0 Oh. 26 And he came here in 1947, so. And my mom, you know,

they both met at the A&P.

- 1 O Oh.
- A They came -- they are from different parts of Ireland, and they met when they were working in the A&P.
 - Q Oh. So, they came over separately --
- 5 A Yes.

6

7

8

10

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

Q -- but they met?

And I think that a lot of people probably don't know what the A&P is, because I'm not sure.

- 9 A That's old?
 - Q I'm not sure it's around any -- well, it's?
- 11 A Vintage.
- 12 Q Vintage. The A&P was a supermarket chain?
- 13 A Yes. Yeah.
- Q And so they didn't know each other in Ireland but they met in the aisles of the A&P?

A Yeah. Actually, there was a dance, and my father was very quiet, and my mother needed a date. You didn't go to a dance on your own, so my mother asked him to pick her up and bring her to this Irish dance.

- O At the A&P or somewhere else?
- A No. At like an Irish hall. And, he did that, and they went together, and they, you know, didn't hang out together, he just had to bring her there. And, I don't know after that, they were married six months later.
- Q Maybe you can get some of the details at his 100th birthday. He's turning 100 when?
 - A He'll been 100, yes. We are having a party for him

```
1
      at my house.
 2
          Q
              Okay.
 3
              He has nieces coming in from Ireland to celebrate
      with him.
 4
 5
          0
              Great.
 6
                    And, so, your dad and mom were both Irish
 7
      immigrants, they got married. They certainly had a run with
 8
      children?
 9
              Yes.
          Α
10
              They have ten children; is that right?
          Q
11
              Ten children: Five boys, five girls.
          Α
12
              Okay. And where do you fit in in the whole clan?
          0
13
          Α
              I'm number nine.
14
              Number nine. All right.
          Q
15
              My mother had nine children in thirteen years, and
16
      then eight years later, when she was forty-six, she had my
17
      little sister.
18
              And, so, you got to be the baby for --
19
              I was the baby for a long time.
20
              Okay. And your dad and mom -- did your dad work at
          0
21
      the A&P forever or?
22
          Α
              For 35 years, yes.
23
          0
              And other odd jobs?
24
              Yeah. A lot of odd jobs. He was always working.
25
      That's why he's living to 100 because he doesn't sit down.
26
          Q
              He doesn't.
27
              Still doesn't sit down. He gardens, he bakes, he
```

cooks. He's amazing.

Q And what about -- what ab

- Q And what about -- what about the kids? What type of environment did you grow up in? Was work part of your life?
 - A Crazy. You know.
 - Q Crazy.

- A I know Francine was saying crazy fours, crazy ten.

 Um, very close. Our family is very close. You know,
 everybody lived at home. My oldest sister moved away when
 she was 21, but other than that, everyone has lived in our
 house. My parents bought a two-family house because the
 only way they could afford a house, was if they had renters
 over them. And we, you know, we had -- we had bedrooms in
 the basement. You know, we just all managed. One
 bathroom -- well, one and a half bathrooms. My father put a
 bathroom in in the basement to help -- help us out.
- Q Did you have to take a number? Like you could have brought the thing --
- So, I would infer that you shared a room with your siblings your entire childhood?
- A All -- yes. Different siblings. You know, I had a room with my sister, Madeline, I had a room with my brother, Jerry, I had a room with my sister, Christine. We would switch it up.
- Q Okay. And in terms of your -- I assume you went to high school where, in the Bronx?
- A Yes. My parents were very serious about us all going to Catholic school. We all went to Catholic school. And

1 then pretty much after high school, it was, you know, you 2 made your decision. My father was on his own when he was 3 15, so I think they felt like after high school you decided 4 what you wanted to do. If you wanted to go to college, you know, that was up to you. So, you know, some of my brothers 5 6 were police officers, and one brother was a fireman, and 7 somebody else worked for the MTA. I decided I wanted to be 8 a teacher. I always loved children. I took the first 9 semester off. I waitressed, and then I ended up going --10 living at home and going to school in New York in Dobbs 11 Ferry Mercy College. And I just waitressed, and lived at 12 home, and went to school. It wasn't really a decision, it 13 was just something I always knew what I wanted to do. And 14 then went on, and I thought, I don't want to work and have 15 to go for my, you know, masters, so I continued to waitress, 16 and living at home, and I went and got my masters in 17 reading. 18 So, you did your full education before you started 19 teaching? 20 Yes. Α 21 Is that what you are saying? Okay. Q 22 And the education, was that all at Mercy 23 College or? 24 I also went to City College, Lehman College in the 25 Bronx. 26 Where is that, Bronx also? Q 27 Yeah.

1 Did you ever get out of the Bronx? 2 I lived in the Bronx until I was 30. Α 3 Okay. So I quess --4 Yeah. Α 5 And, now, did there -- and did you become a teacher 6 somewhere in New York City? 7 I taught in the Bronx for years. Α 8 When did you start teaching? About how old were you? 9 Twenty-seven maybe, twenty-six. 10 And what was the -- was it an elementary school? Q It was an elementary school in the Bronx. I started 11 Α 12 at a second grade teacher. I continued to live at home, and 13 then became a reading teacher, and then ended up moving and 14 teaching -- well --15 You are still teaching? 16 Α Yes. I'm still teaching. 17 Let's just get to the foreshadow here. Q 18 Α Yeah. 19 And at some point, did you meet a certain gentleman? 0 20 Α I did. 21 Maybe that's a loose term --22 Yeah. Α 23 Q -- but you met a quy? 24 Two teacher friends. They were a married couple, 25 used to talk about their friend that lived in Nashville,

Tennessee. And, you know, always talked so fondly of him.

And I went to a party. I was invited to a Labor Day weekend

26

party in New Rochelle, New York, and there was a great band, and Mark was playing, and he was playing a lot of Grateful Dead. I'm a big Grateful Dead fan.

Q Really? Full of surprises.

A And, I just -- I didn't even know he was the person that they used to talk about. So, we got to talking that night, and my family, my parents at this point had become snow birds, and they were in Florida, and it turns out that Mark had lived in the same town that my parents now/then lived in, DeLand, Florida, which no one has ever heard of, and I thought he was kind of pulling -- he thought I was pulling his leg when I said that my parents lived in DeLand. And we had a lot of other similarities. He ended up going to Mercy College. He was there a little bit before me. There were, you know, just a lot of coincidences. So, we ended up talking, and he lived in Nashville, and we, I guess, started dating, although he lived in Nashville and I was in New York.

Q Now, so Mark is -- he was in the band, and what did he play?

A He was a guitar -- he's a guitar player. He's a very good guitar player.

Q Now, were you in a relationship at the time you met Mark?

A I had just gotten out of a long-term relationship and he had just gotten out of a long-term relationship.

Q And what was it about Mark that you found attractive

or attracted you to him?

A Mark was just different than anyone I had ever met. He was really down-to-earth. We kind of laughed, because one of the things I really liked about him is, he showed up and he had a lunch box with his CDs in them. And I thought, boy, he must be real he secure with himself that he can walk around. I had dated somebody that was much more into, like, everything had to be the best and, you know. Mark was just so down-to-earth. What you saw was what you got, and I just, immediately, fell in love with that.

Q And he played in a band, and he played the Grateful Dead, so that probably didn't hurt; right?

So, tell us this -- you had a long distance relationship with Mark for a while?

A Yeah. We dated for two years. It's funny, because I just told my daughter this, like, in the last few months.

We dated, but we probably saw each other ten times, because we would talk on the phone all the time, but he would come home maybe once a month, or once every two months, and his father had passed away right when I met him, so he would spend a lot of time with his mother to just be with her.

So, I might see him for two hours or, you know, go out to dinner, and he would have to go back, and he really was attentive to his mother. And my daughter was, like -- you know, he was in Nashville, and then we decided we wanted to get married, and he moved back to New York -- and she said, you married him and you hardly knew him. But we had spent

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

And then --

```
hours and hours on the phone. I mean, he would call me
after his gig. It might be 1:00 in the morning, and we
would talk until 5:00 in the morning, and then I would go to
work.
       Which probably was like 6:00 in the morning.
   0
             But you stayed up to talk to Mark?
       Yeah. For hours.
   Α
       So, you got married. Where did you get married?
       Well, when Mark moved back to New York, we ended up
moving in with my brother and his family in Yorktown Heights
in New York. We got married in Yorktown Heights.
       And how long did you live -- how long was it between
then and having your first child?
       Child? We got married in '98. We met in '96. We
got married in '98, and then we had our first child, James,
in 2000. By that time, we had moved to Pawling. We bought
a townhouse in Pawling. I still worked in the Bronx.
       Is that a long commute?
       It was like 60 miles. It was a long commute. It's
Duchess County. So, we bought a townhouse in Pawling.
Because my sister lived in Connecticut, in Ridgefield -- two
sisters -- so we wanted to be close to them.
   0
       And how many -- when you moved out to Pawling --
   Α
       Pawling.
       -- how many -- it was James is the oldest?
   Q
       We had James in 2000.
   Α
```

- A And then we had Natalie in 2001.

 And then, did another --
 - Q Daniel was born. What was Daniel's birthday?

And then we had Daniel in 2005.

- 5 A September 27th.
 - Q And, so, his birthday would have been last week?
 - A Mm-hmm. He would have been 17.
- 8 Q Seventeen.

Α

3

4

6

7

11

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

Now, can you just tell us how the Barden -did you go by Gilbin[sic] at the time?

- A Giblin?
- 12 Q Sorry.
- A That's all right. No. No.
 - Q How did the clan end up, then, in Sandy Hook?
 - A Well, we lived in Pawling in a townhouse, and I worked in Pawling. My sister, actually, lived in Ridgefield and she -- her husband went to China for -- he worked for IBN. He had a two year -- he went to China and we house sat for them. So, we --
 - Q In Ridgefield?
 - A In Ridgefield.
 - Q So, we lived in their house and we were able to save some money. You know, we knew that we wanted to move to Connecticut. So, we lived there for two years. And then, we just decided Ridgefield we couldn't really afford, and we knew that Newtown had really good schools, so we decided that we would, after the two years was up, we went to

Newtown. We moved to Sandy Hook.

Q Now, you were working full-time during this whole time; right?

A Mm-hmm.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

Q And you've got three little kids growing up, but young kids. What's Mark doing?

A So, Mark actually was a stay-at-home dad. And he worked -- you know, he played music at night.

Q Had he stopped going to Nashville and?

Yeah. Well, he was home. Basically, what we would do is, I would work during the day, I would come home, we would have dinner together, and then Mark would -sometimes he would have to travel into Manhattan. He had a regular Tuesday night gig in Manhattan. On Wednesday night he had a regular Wednesday night gig in Connecticut, in Greenwich, and then he would pick up gigs from -- you know, anybody that would hire him, he would take on the weekends. And I know a lot of people used to say, that must be hard, but we really felt like the kids had the best of it. He was a great stay-at-home dad. I mean, he was -- he was so attentive, and he would take them to museums. And Mark has a lot of interests, so he would bring them to, you know -you know, he's a big train guy. So, they would go look all over for trains. He was, you know, always playing music with the kids. He just was very hands-on and then he would work at night. So, sometimes he would come home at 2:00 in the morning and he would have to be up at 6:00 or 7:00,

ready with the kids, because I was going to work. But it really worked for us because we felt the kids were getting the best, and somehow we did get to spend a lot of time together. You know, when he was home, we weren't watching TV, we were hanging out together, talking. We would have dinner together. I never felt like we were two ships passing. You know, that expression? I never felt that. I felt like we had a very strong relationship even though our schedules didn't seem to jive.

Q And then can you tell us, you know -- you know that Alex Jones said that Daniel never existed as (INDISCERNIBLE) that you were actors, that you made the whole thing up because you have some motive -- some kind of a motive, you are fakes. So, can you just tell us a little bit of some stories about Daniel. Just tell the jury a couple things about Daniel?

A Daniel was our baby, and because of it, he got a lot of attention from James and Natalie. And I think because of that, he was this -- well, he was definitely your rough and tumble. He was out there playing with the big boys. You know, he would get a bloody lip, he didn't care. But, yet, he was so compassionate, and thoughtful, and so aware of others. It was -- sometimes Mark and I would say, where did that come from. It was strange the way he was. Like, an example would be, first day of, you know, school, when he was in first day, they would come home. He would talk to James, how was wore first day? How was your teachers?

Q Daniel would talk to James or you would ask about that?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

I would ask them. I would ask them questions about their first day. You know, it's their first day of class. How are your teachers? What are you thinking? James and Natalie always were, you know, you know, everything is great, they liked their teachers. So, in first grade, I asked Daniel, so what do you think of your teacher this year? And he says, I'm not sure. And I said, what do you mean you are not sure? And he goes, there was a little girl that was playing with her barrette, or she had it in her hand, and the teacher said, if you don't put that away, I'm going to take it from you. And, I said, and? goes, don't you think that was a little threatening, mom? He said, I just feel like she should have given her a warning. He said, I really didn't like the way the teacher talked to her. And I said, who is the little girl? And he says, I don't even know her name. But he really was --I just thought, what kid thinks like that? He's seven and he is worrying about some little girl that he thought was being threatened. And I had to explain to him, I'm a teacher. I said, Daniel, everyone is a little nervous. The teachers try to make the rules for the year and, you know, don't be so hard on the teacher. And he's, like, okay, but I just -- he really -- he felt that. He felt what that little girl. You know, he didn't like that. He was always like, you know, there would be a little bit of milk, he

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

wouldn't finish it. I would have to say some for the next person. He was always worrying about making -- you know, he would never go out the door first. You first. He was always trying to put the people ahead of him. ATTY. KOSKOFF: Can we show the jury some pictures of this young gentleman? Let's show, first five -- I'm going to move to admit it if there is no objection. 584, 585, and 586. These are all just photos? ATTY. PATTIS: Correct, Judge. No objection. ATTY. KOSKOFF: Can he we show them 586? What, is everybody a Yankee fan? Oh, it's the Bronx, right. So, you got -- tell us who we are looking at here? Α James, Daniel in the middle, and Natalie. Okay. And do you know roughly when this picture 0 would have been taken? It was in -- I think it was in Stone Harbor. It was probably in 2011, in the summer. Stone Harbor, New Jersey. ATTY. MATTEI: And can we look at 585? Q So, that's you and Mark? We were in our stairs. I don't really remember that picture being taken. I've seen it, but I don't really remember it being taken. I think it was probably, I'm quessing, around the holiday of Thanksqiving when we had family in 2012.

- Q Of what year?
- 2 A We always did Thanksgiving. We hosted Thanksgiving.
- 3 My sister would host Christmas. And I think -- I think one
- of my nieces took that, Mark probably remembers.
- 5 Q But you think it was Thanksgiving in 2012?
- 6 A Yes.

- 7 Q And Daniel's school -- obligatory school shot, I
- 8 think, 584? Wow.
- 9 A Yeah.
- 10 Q Was this a school picture?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q For his first grade?
- 13 A Yeah.
- Q All right. Now, Jackie, we are going to cover this
- 15 very lightly, okay.
- I just want to ask you, you know, I know you are a
- 17 teacher, so you leave very early in the morning. When was
- the last time that you saw Daniel alive?
- 19 A Well, I saw him briefly that morning. The night
- 20 before, Mark was working, Thursday night, so we spent time
- 21 together. We had our little routine. I would be cleaning
- up the kitchen, and he would go up and pick three books, and
- he would wait.
- Q Who would, Mark or Daniel?
- A No. Daniel would wait upstairs in bed for me. He
- would pick his three books. I would go up and read to him.
- 27 So that Thursday, he went up to get his books, and I got

distracted and I got up there late, and it was, like, close to 9 o'clock, and I would really try to get them in bed much earlier than that. And I said, Daniel, I don't think we are going to have time to read. And what he would always do, every night, was he would hear me coming and he would stick the three books under his pillow and he would lay there and wait for me to come in. And I would say, where are your books? And he would say, I forgot to get them. And then I would put my head on pillow, and I would feel them, and he would bust up laughing. He did this every night. So, that happened. I said, but I said I don't think I'm going to read to you tonight. It's so late. And he said, okay. And I said, I'm so sorry. And he said, that's okay, mom. He would never argue or never get mad. And I just said, okay, I'll read one book.

Q You gave in?

A Because, it was so late. He was sniffling. Okay, mom, you don't have to read to me. So, of course, I tried to pick the shortest book. And he said, I read that while I was waiting. And, so, I read him The Principal's New Clothes, was the second shortest book. And we read the book, or I read the book to him. And I remember hugging him that night and it being -- I'm usually very distracted, and trying to get everything done and, you know, thinking about lunches tomorrow. And I used to always be envious of Mark because he could really be in the moment, and he could really take the kids in. But that night I do remember

thinking this is how it feels, because it was really the first time I ever -- I don't know why -- I hugged him and I really -- I thought, this is the way Mark feels every time he hugs our kids because, I don't know, it's weird. So, that was the last night I had with him. And in the morning, I would get up earlier. And, usually, I would go downstairs to blow my hair because I didn't want to make the kids. We had a little bathroom. And that morning, he did come in to me, in the bathroom. He really liked the heat. He would want me to blow him with my hair dryer. So, he sat on the toilet while I was doing my hair and was telling me about his new reading partner that he had at school. They had just changed reading partners.

Q And what were the plans for that weekend? Was he scheduled to go to a birthday party?

A Daniel had a birthday party for go to. There was a little girl in his class that was celebrating their birthday.

Again, Mark was much more involved with the school, and he knew the kids, and he knew the parents, and I didn't.

Q Right.

A So, I remember that Thursday before asking Daniel about this little girl and saying, like, so what do you play with, you know, what do you do with her, what do you talk about? And he said, oh, mommy, she doesn't talk. And I said, what do you mean? And he said, she doesn't talk, but

she's really good at listening. He says, I talk to her. I know she hears me. I mean, he just didn't think that she was -- he just accepted what somebody was.

O Mm-hmm.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

And, I'm sorry to ask you that -- there, obviously, came a time that you found out something had happened at the school; is that right?

I was in my second grade classroom. And, normally, I turn my phone off, but for some reason it was ringing. it was -- I think a robo call. So, I called Mark and told him that I had received a call, and he said I'll look into it. And, then, I think I called him again and he was still trying to figure out what was happening. And, then, at that point, I was taken out of my classroom and I sat with my principal. I didn't know how serious it was, so I didn't leave right away. I remember thinking, initially, it must be, like, the high school, maybe a parent was upset. And it was -- you know, I didn't realize that it was in Daniel's school. And then when I did find out it was in Daniel's school, I'm such a denial person, that immediately I just thought, he's fine, it's Daniel, he's different. I remember saying that to my principal, Daniel is a different kid, you know, he's going to be fine. It's --

Q Can you just tell us, what hours, if you were at the firehouse, and just what hours you were there? If you recall.

A I think I probably left the school at, like, I'm

1 quessing --2 You are talking about your school where you worked? 3 Α My school in New York, in Pawling, New York. It's about 50 minutes away. I think I left there, at maybe 4 5 11:00. I don't really remember, and I think we were there 6 till, I'm quessing, 4:00 -- 3:00, 4:00. I don't, again --7 it's -- everything is really a blur. 8 And, obviously, the plans changed and you had to 9 make accommodations for what happened. Do you want to give 10 us an overview of that? 11 Α Of what happened after? 12 0 Well, you had to -- you had to make arrangements, 13 like, happened at the Barden household and? 14 Well, we were driven home by, you know, a state 15 trooper, and our kids, Natalie and James, were at a 16 neighbor's house. So --17 All right. Were they in the school? 0 18 No. 19 They were older? 0 20 They were in different schools. They were each in a Α 21 different school. Newtown has intermediate and then middle 22 school. 23 So, people started coming to our house. By, 24 you know, 6 o'clock, our house was filled with people. And 25 then we had to get Natalie and James and tell them. 26 Now, Jackie, did -- and did there come a time when

you became aware of something happening in the community, or

the world, or your world, that was related to something about you being an actor, a fraud, a faker, something along those lines?

A I don't know the sequence of events. I remember when hearing about Robbie being attacked -- Robbie Parker.

Q Who told you?

A I don't remember. I just -- I was aware. I don't know if I saw it on television, or I read it, or someone told me. I just remembered thinking, how can that be.

Q And you know from, at least from being in court, that Infowars was on the air on the 15th attacking Robbie Parker?

- A I don't really remember.
- Q You never knew that; right?

A I just remember someone attacking Robbie Parker. I also remember Mark had a -- Mark being a musician, he had a MarkBarden.com. It was his music post. It was basically if anyone wanted to find out where he was playing, or he would put snippets of music on. And I remember him getting upset because people starting coming onto his music page and making statements about being phony, and actor. And a lot of this stuff he kept from me, so I would get little snippets of just what he was going through. I also started becoming aware he had YouTube channels, and that was another place that, you know, he would post the kids playing together. Being that he -- you know, music was so important to him, Natalie sang, Danny was the little drummer, and James played base. And he would post things on his YouTube

channel. And nobody ever commented. It was basically for friends and family. It wasn't anything. But he started getting attacked on that.

- Q And did you -- you described Mark. I'm picturing a Grateful Dead guitar player and a pretty --
 - A Mark is like the calmest person.
- Q Okay. And did you notice a change in Mark's behavior or personally?
 - A Yes. Definitely.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

Q Can you tell the jury about that?

Well, I mean, he would get really angry when he would Α find these comments. You know, here they were saying that Daniel was -- I mean, they were different things. Daniel was never -- never existed. Our son, James, was Daniel, and we are trying to, you know, pretend that we had a loss, or some people would write about that we killed Daniel. mean, it was crazy stuff that they were posting. And Mark would just get really angry and, you know, he started becoming, like -- you know, we moved to Connecticut, we wanted to get out of the city. We used to, like, leave our windows open. That stopped. It was, like, the windows were down at night especially. He would put the blinds, he would close the curtains. He was always afraid somebody was going to be looking in the house. You know, when we would go shopping, he would, you know, be scanning and looking around to see if anybody looked at him in a weird way. You know, I used to -- you know, we used to kind of, I mean, not get

into a fight, but I would say, like, we need to go and buy 1 2 this, like, you are preoccupied. He would become 3 preoccupied with worrying about who is around him. 4 Was this like him or was this --5 Α No, no. 6 -- something that you hadn't observed before? 7 He was, like you said, a Grateful Dead, peace, love. Α 8 I me, he's very protective of his family. I mean, very 9 protective. So, I felt -- I think he felt like he had to 10 protect us, and he was always -- especially if he was with James and Natalie, like, Natalie would even know because she 11 12 would say, like, oh, I don't want to go to the store, or I 13 don't want to do this, because she was afraid that he might 14 be -- she could tell the difference in him too. 15 So, the kids started -- or at least Natalie, you 16 say, started to notice a difference in the behavior of their 17 dad? 18 I think so. I definitely think that -- he was --19 he's hypervigilant. He's always just very aware of his 20 surroundings. Just the other day, we were driving into our 21 neighborhood, and there was a car in front of us, and he 22 slows down because he wants to see where the car is going, 23 if they are going to slow down by our house. You know, he 24 slowed down. They passed our house and then it was fine, 25 but he was aware of that car. 26 Did you and Mark get threatening letters or letters

that gave you concern for your safety?

There was letters. Again, he didn't show me a 1 Yeah. 2 lot of stuff, so I'm not sure exactly. But there were 3 letters. 4 Do you know whether -- and Mark is going to testify. He's going to -- he's the last plaintiff to testify this 5 6 afternoon in the case, but he's going to testify. But to 7 your understanding, did Mark -- was Mark engaged in law 8 enforcement in relationship to the threats he was getting 9 online or did he keep that from you? 10 I mean, I know that he did show me one letter, 11 and it talked about -- well he showed me maybe two. I'm not 12 sure. I remember one saying that they were at Daniel's 13 grave, and they had peed on his grave, because they didn't 14 think anybody -- you know, they didn't believe that Daniel 15 was buried. And another letter --16 These letters came to your home? Q 17 What's that? Α 18 These letters came to your home? 19 Yeah. And then another letter was that they are 20 going to -- they were going to dig Daniel's grave up, 21 because he wasn't there, to prove it. So, those were two 22 that I know. I don't know other stuff. I know my sister 23 has gone to Daniel's grave and she'll -- has pulled up, and 24 people will --25 ATTY. PATTIS: Objection. Hearsay, Judge. 26 THE COURT: Okay.

Well, but now you --

THE COURT: Overruled.

- Q Go ahead. You can continue, Jackie. You can continue.
- A She has pulled up, and people will leave his grave.

 And she'll say, you know, she had a bad feeling. She would share with us that she had -- it was an uncomfortable situation.
- Q And did you and Mark take steps to protect the children from becoming aware of these threatening letters and other hostile --
 - A We really tried to not share any of that with them.
 - Q Okay.

- A We --
- Q Sorry. Go ahead.
 - A No. I was just going to say, we tried to make our household as happy and light as possible. They had just lost their brother and we -- you know, we really tried to hold it together. I remember saying, like, they have to have a happy childhood. We had worked so hard at that and we didn't want that to be taken from them, so we really, kind of, protected them from a lot of stuff.
 - Q And, so, the shooting had occurred, and now you were protecting -- you had to protect them from this other forces out there, people infected with these lies who believed you were so despicable that you would fake your own kid's death?
 - A Right. Yeah. It was enough that they lost their brother, that they didn't really need to know, then, that

their father was being attacked, and that we were being accused. I mean, I did remember seeing -- looking on -- and I don't know what the web page was, but there was a web page that, you know, it was pictures of the three of them.

And they would always -- they would circle James and say this is, you know, really Daniel. And there was another picture of my sister, and her husband, and Daniel, and we would go to my sister's house for dinner. And, you know, this person isn't real, and this is -- and that was another website that I remember coming across.

Q Can I ask you about -- I think I'm getting the impression that you are not as -- don't have as much of an online presence as some other people?

A No. I mean, I have Facebook, but that's it. My niece started a page for our son, Daniel, What Would Daniel Do, probably, like, in January of 2013.

Q And tell us about that? Have you -- are you actively -- review that?

A No. Yes. It's -- well, it started with her -- my niece has a 16 -- at the time, her daughter was 16, and the daughter was in high school, and this was somebody that was kind of a loner. And her niece -- her daughter said, what would Daniel do if he saw somebody that was alone? So, she went up to him and had a very short little conversation just checking in. You know, hi, I'm Mariah, and they spoke, and she went about her day, and later in the day, this boy came up to her and said, thank you. Thanks for just saying hello

to me. You know, it meant a lot. So, Mariah went back to her mother and said this, and my niece said -- Mariah said, I thought of Daniel, and I kind of reached out. So, Jackie started this Facebook page, and it was all about kindness, and including others, and telling stories of Daniel, and all these things that he would do, pictures of him, pictures of the family. It was just -- so Jackie started saying that there are some people on there that would make comments, and she was very good about -- she would just block them. She had to block over 100 people.

Q They hit that pretty hard, didn't they?

A Yeah. There is an awful lot of nice, good, caring

- A Yeah. There is an awful lot of nice, good, caring people. She would always highlight that. Jackie, there is so many good people out there --
 - Q Right.

- A -- and you just -- but it was over 100 times that she would block -- had to block people.
- Q And that was back then at some point you got that count. Is What Would Daniel Do still up and running?
 - A Yes.
 - Q And does that give you comfort in terms of being a memory of Daniel?
 - A Sure. Yes.
 - Q Pretending that I saw the time but I can't see it.
- So, and thank you, Jackie, for describing your observations about Mark, about this difficult time.
 - I want to ask you something about your

1 children, though. 2 You said Mark was very protective. 3 quessing you are a close second? 4 Α Yeah. Can you tell us, are your children, James and 5 6 Natalie, tell us a little bit, are they the same kind of 7 person? Are they different? Do they --8 They are different. James is -- he's in his last 9 year of college now. He's kind of quiet, to himself. 10 mean, that -- I don't know. He's a typical boy. You know, 11 nothing kind of -- he doesn't get too ruffled by things. 12 Although, he did get a phone call from someone late at night on his phone when he was in college, and it turned out to be 13 14 a hoaxer in Utah. We don't know how they got his phone. 15 So, he called Mark. I'm not really even sure how that --16 what went on, but he called Mark and --17 What's that like as a parent? Is that -- was that 0 18 distressing? 19 Oh, terrifying. And for them to -- and they spoke to 20 him, and he didn't realize, even, who they were. They were 21 trying to -- you know, they were asking him questions, and 22 he, being polite, he was answering questions. And then he 23 called Mark and said it was kind of strange somebody called 24 me late at night, they said that they knew you, and I think 25 Mark kind of found out who they were, and --

So, Mark dealt with that with James?

So, Mark dealt with that.

26

27

Q

```
1
              Now, you have -- Mark has a relationship with both
 2
      James and Natalie, but when Natalie calls, does she --
 3
          Α
              She has a very good relationship with Mark, but she
 4
      definitely comes, you know, she tells me more of her
      personal things. She's --
 5
 6
              And how old is Natalie now?
 7
             Natalie is 20.
          Α
 8
              And so how old -- so, she would have been, like,
 9
      10 -- or 10 or 11 at the time?
10
          Α
              Ten.
              And she's in college; right?
11
          Q
12
              She's in college.
          Α
13
              You don't have to say where, by the way. I know that
14
      you are anxious about that.
15
          Α
              Yeah.
16
          Q
              But can you tell the jury, from your observations, as
17
      Natalie's mother --
18
              How she does?
19
          0
              Right.
20
              She has a lot of anxiety. She has a lot of fear.
          Α
21
      You know, when she's at home -- well, I mean, going back,
22
      while she was in high school, when she would be at home, if
23
      Mark and I went out to dinner, she would be calling us.
24
      When are you coming home? When are you coming home? If
25
      she's home by herself, she's really, really stressed. She
26
      won't, like, would never take a shower if she was the only
```

person in the house because she's very afraid of being home

alone. She'll -- she'll look out just to watch for cars.

Even when we are watching TV, she'll say, did you hear that?

She's, like, check to see if there is a car. She's always

afraid a car is going to be pulling into our driveway.

Q Was she like this before you and others were being accused of being actors and faking?

A No.

Q Okay. So, it was only --

A I don't know when it started, but it was a gradual thing. One time, we had a light out by our driveway and somebody was coming in, you know, pulled up, and they wanted -- I guess they thought that the light was shining too brightly, and it was distracting, and they just wanted to let us know, you know, maybe you should move that light. And she went nuts, like, freaked out. It was dark. Don't get the door, don't get the door. She was afraid that somebody was coming for us.

Q And do you know how she became aware of what was going on out there? You guys tried to protect her, right?

A We did. You know, we didn't even think she was going to go to college. We knew that she was going to go to college, but we were afraid that she wasn't going to be able to handle being away, and it was heartbreaking to learn that she realized when she went to college, she felt better. She said, when I come home, I'm afraid. When I'm in college, nobody knows who I am. And we felt terrible. We thought we should have moved because we always -- we didn't realize

```
1
            We really didn't at the time until -- and I don't
 2
      think she realized that. She didn't realize until she went
 3
      away that she was better in college. She'll say, I feel
 4
      better when I'm at a friend's house because nobody knows who
      I am, but when I'm home, I feel like I'm a target.
 5
                   And we even -- we did think about moving, but
 6
 7
      the kids really wanted to stay in the house, but I don't --
 8
      it was, like, we didn't know what to do.
 9
              So, she's not as comfortable in her own home as she
10
      is --
11
              No.
          Α
12
                   at college, because she can be more anonymous
          0
13
      in --
14
                   Definitely.
          Α
              Yes.
15
              Wow.
16
          Α
              So, we --
17
              Was that -- is that hard on you --
          0
18
              Oh, it's terrible. It's terrible to think your
19
      20-year old daughter is so afraid that -- or that when she
20
      comes home she's so afraid.
21
              And, Jackie, thank you again. Did you recently learn
22
      that despite your best efforts to protect Natalie --
23
          Α
              Yeah, well --
24
               -- that something had happened?
25
              We always thought that she didn't know a lot of this
26
      stuff, but our phones are connected weird. I don't know --
```

I don't really understand technology, but I think we have

```
1
      the same Apple ID. So, a lot of times, like, Mark's phone
 2
      will ring and it will be Natalie's friend on the phone. You
 3
      know, he can see Natalie's, and he's, like, oh, that call is
 4
      for her. And she just told us a few weeks ago, she said, I
 5
      remember seeing -- you know, Mark took a photo of the letter
 6
      saying that they wanted to dig Daniel's grave up, and she
 7
      had seen it on her phone -- on the phone. And we didn't
 8
      know. She never told us, but she said, I knew that dad was
 9
      getting threats, but we didn't know that she knew.
10
              You didn't know that until two weeks ago?
11
          Α
             Yeah.
12
              She kept that --
13
              Yeah. We didn't know. But she just kind of matter
14
      of factly said, oh yeah, I knew that he was getting threats.
15
      I remember seeing it on the phone about that letter.
16
              And she kept that from you for years? She didn't
17
      tell you?
18
                   We were both shocked when she told us that she
19
      knew about that letter.
20
              As a parent, were you -- were you --
21
              Oh, heartbreaking. That's all you want to do is
          Α
22
      protect your child.
23
          0
              And she was trying to protect you?
24
          Α
              Yeah.
25
          Q
              Okay.
26
                   ATTY. KOSKOFF: No further questions.
27
                    Thank you, Jackie.
```

1 THE COURT: Attorney Pattis? 2 ATTY. PATTIS: No questions, Judge. 3 THE COURT: All right. You have may step down. 4 THE WITNESS: Thank you. 5 THE COURT: Just watch your step. 6 So, this is good timing. We will take our hour 7 lunch. You will return at 2 p.m. 8 If you are going out, I don't know what the 9 weather is like out there but, boy, it looks pretty 10 windy. The trees are blowing. Just be careful to 11 avoid the front steps of the courthouse. There may 12 be media or press coverage there, and I certainly 13 want to make sure that you don't overhear anything 14 that you shouldn't be overhearing so we can avoid any 15 problems like that. I know you have the entrance 16 that you come in and out, so try to steer clear of 17 the front steps of the courthouse. You'll continue 18 to obey your rules of juror conduct. 19 And Ron will collect your notepads. 20 And I hope you have a nice lunch. 21 Take a recess. 22 (JURY EXIT). 23 (LUNCH RECESS) 24 25 26 27

X06-UWY-CV18-6046436-S: SUPERIOR COURT 1 2 ERICA LAFFERTY : COMPLEX LITIGATION DOCKET 3 : AT WATERBURY, CONNECTICUT ALEX EMRIC JONES : OCTOBER 4, 2022 4 5 X06-UWY-CV18-6046437-S: SUPERIOR COURT 6 WILLIAM SHERLACH : COMPLEX LITIGATION DOCKET 7 : AT WATERBURY, CONNECTICUT 8 ALEX EMRIC JONES : October 4, 2022 X06-UWY-CV18-6046438-S: SUPERIOR COURT 9 10 WILLIAM SHERLACH : COMPLEX LITIGATION DOCKET : AT WATERBURY, CONNECTICUT 11 12 ALEX EMRIC JONES : October 4, 2022 13 CERTIFICATE 14 15 I, Linda A. Coon, hereby certify that this is a true 16 and accurate transcription of the above-referenced case, 17 heard in Superior Court, Judicial District of Waterbury, 18 Connecticut, before the Honorable Barbara N. Bellis, on this 19 4th day of October, 2022. 20 Dated this 5th day of October, 2022, in Waterbury, 21 Connecticut. 22 23 24 25 Linda A. Coon, Court Monitor/ Court Reporter 26

1 X06-UWY-CV18-6046436-S : SUPERIOR COURT ERICA LAFFERTY : COMPLEX LITIGATION DOCKET 2 3 : AT WATERBURY, CONNECTICUT 4 ALEX EMRIC JONES : OCTOBER 4, 2022 5 X06-UWY-CV18-6046437-S : SUPERIOR COURT 6 WILLIAM SHERLACH : COMPLEX LITIGATION DOCKET 7 : AT WATERBURY, CONNECTICUT 8 ALEX EMRIC JONES : OCTOBER 4, 2022 9 X06-UWY-CV18-6046438-S : SUPERIOR COURT 10 WILLIAM SHERLACH : COMPLEX LITIGATION DOCKET 11 : AT WATERBURY, CONNECTICUT 12 ALEX EMRIC JONES : OCTOBER 4, 2022 13 ELECTRONIC CERTIFICATE 14 15 16 I, Linda A. Coon, hereby certify that this is a true 17 and accurate electronic version of the above-referenced 18 case, heard in Superior Court, Judicial District of 19 Waterbury, Connecticut, before the Honorable Barbara N. 20 Bellis, on this 4th day of October, 2022. 21 22 Dated this 5th day of October, 2022, in Waterbury, 23 Connecticut. 24 25 26 Linda A. Coon, Court Monitor/ Court Reporter